

*Microbiology Research Journal International*

*21(6): 1-15, 2017; Article no.MRJI.37422 ISSN: 2456-7043 (Past name: British Microbiology Research Journal, Past ISSN: 2231-0886, NLM ID: 101608140)*

# **Effectiveness of Co-inoculation with** *Pseudomonas koreensis* **and Rhizobia on Growth, Nodulation and Yield of Common Bean (***Phaseolus vulgaris* **L.)**

**Sahar El-Nahrawy1\* and Alaa El-Dein Omara1**

*1 Department of Agricultural Microbiology, Soil, Water and Environment Research Institute, Agricultural Research Center (ARC), Giza, Egypt.*

## *Authors' contributions*

*This work was carried out in collaboration between both authors. Both authors read and approved the final manuscript.*

## *Article Information*

DOI: 10.9734/MRJI/2017/37422 *Editor(s):* (1) Giuseppe Blaiotta, Professor, Department of Agriculture, Division of "Grape and Wine Sciences", University of Naples Federico II, Via Universita' 100 – Palazzo Mascabruno 80055 Portici, Italy. *Reviewers:* (1) Md. Nazmul Haque, Sher-e-Bangla Agricultural University, Bangladesh. (2) Stefan Martyniuk, IUNG-PIB Pulawy, Poland. Complete Peer review History: http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history/21781

*Original Research Article*

*Received 15th October 2017 Accepted 1st November 2017 Published 7th November 2017*

# **ABSTRACT**

The establishment of nodulation, nitrogen fixation and productivity in legumes is affected by specificity of inoculant's strain and effectiveness as well as interactions with rhizosphere microorganisms. This study aimed to isolate and identify *Pseudomonas* isolates and investigates the effect of *Rhizobium* - *Pseudomonas* co-inoculation on growth, nodulation and yield of common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) cv. Nebraska under greenhouse and lyzemeter conditions. In total, 7 *Pseudomonas* isolates were isolated from clay soil and evaluated as co-inoculation by measuring the symbiotic  $N_2$ -fixation parameters under greenhouse. The nine treatments consisted of (seven *Pseudomonas* isolates (PS1-PS7) combinations with *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612), one inoculated with *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612), and one control). One isolate (PS7) exhibited the highest values of growth, symbiosis, photosynthetic and nitrogen content. Based on 16S rRNA sequence, this strain was shown to belong to *Pseudomonas koreensis*.

\_ Lyzemeter experiment was carried out as complete randomized block designed which consisted of four treatments; T<sub>1</sub>= Control, T<sub>2</sub>= Inoculation with *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-

*<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author: E-mail: sahar.elnahrawy@yahoo.com;*

3612),  $T_3$ = Inoculation with *P. koreensis*, and  $T_4 = T_2 + T_3$  with 5 replicates. Co-inoculation treatment significantly enhanced plant height, nodulation, dry biomass and increased macroelements content (N, P and K) and microelements content (Zn, Mn, Fe and Cu) over single inoculation and control at 30 and 60 days of sowing. The treatments  $T_4$  and  $T_3$  recorded the highest values at all growth stages, they recorded 241.00 and 225.66 µg TPF g<sup>-1</sup> soil day<sup>-1</sup> at 30 days and 249.33 and 235.00 µg TPF  $g^{-1}$  soil day<sup>-1</sup> at 60 days and 203.66 and 179.66  $\mu$ g TPF  $g^{-1}$  soil day<sup>-1</sup> at harvest for dehydrogenase activity. Also, phosphatase activity in soil generally reduced with the aging of the plant. Similar trend are showed for seed yield and quality assessment.

Therefore, co-inoculation with *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* and *P. koreensis* could be an effective biofertilization for common bean plant production.

*Keywords: Co-inoculation; common bean; Rhizobium; Pseudomonas; seed yield.*

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

In natural and agricultural systems, bulk soil is often resource-limited and cause maior often resource-limited and cause major constraints to the growth of microorganisms [1]. On the other hand, highly diverse environment occur in the rhizosphere between plant roots, microbes and the soil [2]. In modern agricultural practices, millions of tons of different fertilizers are indiscriminately used to achieve optimum crop yields. These fertilizers leach into the grounds and disrupt the composition and<br>functions of beneficial rhizosphere functions of beneficial rhizosphere microorganism and indirectly human health. So, due to the alarmingly very high costs of fertilizers and some environmental hazards [3].

Common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) is one of the most important crops and represents 50% of the grain legumes consumed worldwide. It is considered as a nearly perfect food mainly because of its high protein content (15%), fiber, carbohydrates, and 30% of the caloric requirement to the world's population as well as other daily food needs such as vitamins and minerals Cu, Ca, Fe, Mg, Mn, Zn [4,5]. In several studies [5-12], who reported that common bean is usually considered a poor nitrogen-fixing legume, poor nodulation and variable response to inoculation is mainly attributed to intrinsic characteristics of the host plant as well as the great sensitivity to other nodulation limiting factors, such as high rates of N fertilizer used, high temperatures and soil dryness.

In agricultural practices, about 80% of Biological Nitrogen Fixation (BNF) come from symbioses formed between leguminous plants and species of *Rhizobium*, *Bradyrhizobium*, *Sinorhizobium*, *Azorhizobium*, *Mesorhizobium*, and *Allorhizobium*, and absorbed directly by the plants and so is less susceptible to volatilization, denitrification, and leaching as well as improve organic fertility and farming system flexibility [13, 14]. In this context, the discovery of rhizobia in 1886, has provided some relief to the poor agronomic practitioners largely due to low cost and abundant availability [15,16]. Indeed, interactions between rhizobia with consortium of microorganisms and legumes plants have been identified for some time as essential in vegetative cover productivity and diversity [17,18], due to complementary phytostimulation traits might enhance legume growth for example, IAA, cytokinin and gibberellin, solubilizing non available P, synthesizing ACC deaminase, producing siderophores and increase nodulation more than any of the single-strain inoculations and secretion of B vitamins by the other microorganisms [19,20,21].

*Pseudomonas* spp. are a major component of the microbial flora, which live in close association with various types of agricultural crops. Their association with plant materials has been related to their ability to colonize and produce plant growth promoting compounds within the rhizosphere [22,23]. Also, *Pseudomonas* strains have been shown to increase plant growth and nutrient uptake of maize, wheat, and legumes in different soils and temperatures [12,24,25,26].

The new fashion in agricultural systems is the use of microbial consortiums of Plant Growth Promoting Bacteria (PGPB), including coinoculation with rhizobia and other microorganisms. Therefore, the use coinoculants can be affected by various factors such as the specificity of inoculant's strain and effectiveness, strain inherent potential and genotype, optimal inoculation dose, composition of root exudates, temperature variation as well as interaction of applied inocula with rhizospheric microflora [27,28]. Several studies in greenhouse and field showed the improvement of legume symbiosis and other microorganisms (PGPR),

due to enhance nodulation, nitrogen fixation and plant productivity in pea and alfalfa [29,30]; common bean and soybean [8]; *Medicago truncatula* [24]; Mungbean [31]; chickpea [32, 33]; Common bean [5,10,12]; Pea [25]; alfalfa [34]; Lucerne [35] and Soybean [11,36,37].

The aim of our study was to isolate and identify *Pseudomonas* isolates, as well as to investigate the effect of co-inoculation with specific rhizobia and the most effective *Pseudomonas* strain to improve nodulation, plant growth and yield of common bean seeds under greenhouse and lyzemeter conditions.

## **2. MATERIALS AND METHODS**

#### **2.1 Organism and Culture Conditions**

#### **2.1.1** *Pseudomonas*

*Pseudomonas* were isolated from clay soil using King's B (KB) agar medium [38], following serial dilution and plating technique. The plates were incubated at 30°C for 48 h. Colonies were picked up, purified by repeated streaking on the same medium and well isolated single colonies were transferred to KB slants to use in further studies. Bacterial identification of the isolates were confirmed by a series of morphological, physiological and biochemical tests as described by Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology [39].

#### **2.1.2** *Rhizobium*

*Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli*  (TAL-3612), was provided from Bacteriology Laboratory, Sakha Agricultural Research Station, Kafr El-Sheikh, Egypt. Pure cultures were routinely maintained on Yeast Extract Mannitol Agar (YEMA) medium [40].

#### **2.2 Greenhouse Experiment**

Leonard's jars were used *in vivo* to evaluate the effect of co-inoculation with different *Pseudomonas* isolates and *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) to improve the growth, nodulation and nitrogen fixation of common bean (*phaseolus vulgaris* L.) cv. Nebraska under sterilized conditions.

A completely randomized design experiment comprised of 9 treatments (seven *Pseudomonas*  isolates (PS1-PS7) combinations with *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612),

one inoculated with *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612), and one control). Jars were filled with clean sand which had been treated with 0.1 M HCl and washed several times with distilled water and the Jars were autoclaved twice at 1.5 par, 121◦ C for 4 h. Seeds of common bean were surface-sterilized using standard methods [41]. Seeds were sown (2 seeds Jar-1 ) and inoculated by pippeting 2 ml of 10<sup>8</sup> CFU ml<sup>-1</sup> with different *Pseudomonas* isolates and 2 ml of  $10^8$  CFU ml<sup>-1</sup> rhizobial liquid culture around each seed. Jars were irrigated twice weekly with nitrogen free nutrient solution prepared as described by [42].

After 45 days from sowing, plants were uprooted and evaluated for shoot length (cm), root depth (cm), shoot dry weight (g), root dry weight (g), number of nodules, nodules dry weight (g), total chlorophyll and N content (mg plant<sup>-1</sup>).

## **2.3 Molecular Identification**

The most effective *Pseudomonas* isolates to improve the growth, nodulation and nitrogen fixation of common bean were chosen to identify by Polymerase Chain Reaction (PCR) at Sigma Scientific Services Co., Giza, Egypt. Genomic DNA of the test bacterial isolates grown on KB broth was extracted with GeneJet Bacterial Genomic DNA Extraction Kit (Fermentas).

The 16S rRNA gene of the isolate was amplified by using universal primers Forward and Reverse (F, 5-AGA GTT TGA TCC TGG CTC AG-3 and R, 5- GGT TAC CTT GTT ACG ACT T-3) used to obtain a PCR product of  $~\sim$  1.5 kb. The sample was placed in a hybridthermal reactor thermocycler (Maxima Hot Start PCR Master Mix (Fermentas). The PCR products were analyzed on 1% (w/v) agarose gels and sent to GATC (Germany) for sequencing using ABI 3730xl DNA sequencer.

The resultant 16S rRNA gene sequences were compared to the GenBank database by using the National Center for Biotechnology Information database (NCBI), using BLASTN program. A dendrogram was constructed using the neighbour-joining method. Also, confidence in tree topology was determined.

#### **2.4 Lyzemeter Experiment**

Lyzemeter experiment was carried out during summer season of 2017 in Sakha Agricultural Research Station, Kafr El-Sheikh Governorate,

Egypt. The study aimed to clarify the impact of co-inoculation with *Pseudomonas koreensis*  MG209738 with *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) on growth, nodulation and yield of common bean (*phaseolus vulgaris* L.) cv. Nebraska.

The Lyzemeter experiment was conducted in clayey soil in texture having the following characteristics:  $pH$ , 7.10; EC, 3.36 dSm<sup>-1</sup>; organic matter (%), 1.53; particle size distribution sand, silt and clay (%), 23.3, 22.1 and 54.6, respectively; soluble cations  $Ca^{+2}$ , Mg<sup>+2</sup>, Na<sup>+</sup> and  $K^+$  (meq  $L^{-1}$ ), 4.38, 8.18, 9.24 and 0.20, respectively; soluble anions  $CO_3^-$ , HCO<sub>3</sub>, Cl<sup>-</sup> and  $SO_4^-$  (meq L<sup>-1</sup>), 0.0, 3.75, 6.72 and 11.53, respectively; available N (mg  $Kg^{-1}$ ), 35.1; available P (mg  $\text{Kg}^1$ ), 8.10; available K (mg  $\text{Kg}^1$ <sup>1</sup>), 250.7; Also, total count of bacteria, 210 x 10<sup>6</sup> CFU g<sup>-1</sup>; total count of fungi, 81 x 10<sup>4</sup> CFU g<sup>-1</sup> and total count of actinomycetes,  $64 \times 10^5$  CFU g<sup>-1</sup>. Physical, chemical and biological properties were determined according to the standard methods reported by [42,43,44], respectively.

The experiment undertaken in lyzemeter composed of 20 units each of 80 × 80 cm, and it was carried out as 4 x 5 complete randomized block designed. It comprised 4 inoculation treatments;  $T_1$ = Control,  $T_2$ = Inoculation with *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli*  (TAL-3612), T3= Inoculation with *Pseudomonas koreensis* MG209738,  $T_4 = T_2 + T_3$ , with 5 replicates for each treatment. Common bean seeds were planted at the rate of 4 seeds per hole with 20 cm space. Thinning was done after complete germination, leaving two plant per hole.

The inoculation treatments were prepared as peat-based inoculums, 15 ml of  $10^8$  CFU ml<sup>-1</sup> from each culture per 30 g of sterilized carrier and mixed with the seeds before sowing using a sticking material. Also, ammonium sulphate (20.5% N) was the N source which, added the active fertilizer dose for all treatment before sowing, and two equal doses at 30 and 45 days from seed sowing for  $T_1$  and  $T_3$  treatments. The other recommended agricultural practices were used such as calcium superphosphate (15%  $P_2O_5$ ) and potassium sulphate (48% K<sub>2</sub>O).

#### **2.5 Growth Parameters**

At 30 and 60 days after sowing, plant samples were taken to determine plant height (cm),

number of nodules plant<sup>-1</sup>, dry weight of plant (g plant<sup>-1</sup>), dry weight of nodules (g plant<sup>-1</sup>), while number of pods, pod yield (g plant $1$ ), seed yield (ton ha<sup>-1</sup>), total carbohydrate  $(%)$  and protein  $(%)$ of common bean plants were determined at harvest.

## **2.6 Plant Mineral Content**

Nitrogen, phosphorus and potassium content (mg  $plant<sup>-1</sup>$ ) were determined according to the methods described by [43]. On the other hand, micronutrients content (mg plant<sup>-1</sup>), Zn, Mn, Fe and Cu were measured using atomic adsorption spectrophotometer (Perkin Elmer 3300) according to [45].

Total carbohydrate contents were extracted from dry finely ground common bean seeds (powdered), according to [46] and estimated colourimetrically by the phenol-sulphuric acid method as described by [47]. For protein content of seeds was calculated as total  $N \times 6.25$  [48]. On the other hand, enzyme activity of dehydrogenase and phosphatase was recorded at 30, 60 and harvest according to [49,50], respectively.

#### **2.7 Statistical Analysis**

Data obtained were subjected to the analysis of variance and treatment means were compared using the L.S.D methods and the difference among treatment means was compared by high range statistical domain (HSD) using Tukey test at 5 % probability according to [51].

#### **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### **3.1 Identification and Characterization**

In the present study, a total of 7 *Pseudomonas*  isolates were isolated from clay soil and primarily identified by morphological, physiological and<br>biochemical characters (Table 1). For characters (Table 1). For morphological characters**,** all isolates showed circular colony, rod cell shape, motile, negative reaction for gram stain, positive fluorescent pigment and variable colour from bright to light green for PS1, PS2, PS4 and PS5 and whiteyellow for PS3, PS6 and PS7. Furthermore, bacterial isolates showed variable results for physiological and biochemical characters (Table 1).

Comparing these characters with those given in Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology [39], the isolates were presumptively identified as *Pseudomonas* sp.

#### **3.2 Greenhouse Experiment**

## **3.2.1 Inoculation effects on common bean growth**

Length, depth and dry matter within shoot and root of plants following co-inoculation with *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) and different isolates of *Pseudomonas* measured at 45 days of growth was variable when common bean was grown in Leonard's jars (Fig. 1).

Generally, co-culture of *Rhizobium* and different isolates of *Pseudomonas* increased length of shoot, depth of root and dry biomass of their compared to control and single inoculation of *Rhizobium*. Inoculation of *Rhizobium* + PS7 isolate was significantly enhanced the length of shoot (22.68 cm plant<sup>-1</sup>), root depth (10.98 plant

 $<sup>1</sup>$ ), dry biomass of shoot and root each by (5.66</sup> and  $2.76$  g plant<sup>-1</sup>) at 45 days compared to control plants. On the contrary, the single inoculation of *Rhizobium* accelerated length of shoot, depth of root and dry biomass of shoot and root by 19.46 cm plant<sup>-1</sup>, 7.46 cm plant<sup>-1</sup> and 4.95 g plant<sup>-1</sup> and 1.90 g plant<sup>-1</sup>, compared to un-inoculated plants (control), respectively.

The co-inoculation effect of *R. leguminosarum* and *Pseudomonas* on growth characteristics of common bean plants was variable. Observation of significant increase in the length of shoots, depth of roots and dry matter accumulation due to the amounts of ACC deaminase, synthesized by *Pseudomonas* and *R leguminosarum* [52], induce metabolic changes [53] and increase the growth of plants [21,54,55]. Besides these, ethylene also affects many physiological processes, such as leaf senescence, leaf abscission [56].

#### **Table 1. Morphological, physiological and biochemical characters of bacterial isolates**



*El-Nahrawy and Omara; MRJI, 21(6): 1-15, 2017; Article no.MRJI.37422*





In agreement to this finding, plants inoculated with *R leguminosarum* and *Pseudomonas* have also shown dramatic increase in plant growth [12,24,31,33,35].

#### **3.2.2 Inoculation effect on common bean symbiosis, photosynthetic and nitrogen content**

Generally, the inoculation of *Rhizobium* used either alone or in combination with isolates of

*Pseudomonas* were increased significantly (P ≤ 0.05).

The formation and distribution of nodules on *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) different isolates of *Pseudomonas* inoculated common bean plants was variable (Fig. 2). A maximum number of nodules (36.33 nodules plant<sup>-1</sup>) and (32.66 nodules plant<sup>-1</sup>) were formed on the root systems of common bean plants when inoculated with co- cultures of PS7

and PS6 isolates and *R. leguminosarum* grown for 45 days in pot experiment, respectively. Similar trend was also exhibited in nodules dry weight parameter.

Among co-culture of *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) and different isolates of *Pseudomonas*. PS7 isolate had maximum positive effect and increased which recorded  $(45$  and 248 mg plant<sup>-1</sup>), followed by PS6 isolate (43 and 241 mg plant<sup>-1</sup>) as compared to control (29.66 and 180 mg plant<sup>-1</sup>) for total chlorophyll content and nitrogen content parameters, respectively. Also, plants coinoculated with *Rhizobium* and *Pseudomonas* isolates accumulated significantly more shoot N content than those inoculated with *Rhizobium* alone.

Recently, most of research is focusing on increasing the legume–rhizobia symbiosis with inoculation of legumes with rhizosphere bacteria. Generally, co-inoculation of PGPR with *Rhizobium* species is a valuable, relevant, profitable, efficient, and environmentally friendly tool, which increased Biological Nitrogen Fixation (BNF), growth and productivity.

Previous studies have demonstrated that PGPR co-inoculation can enhance early nodule initiation and development on soybean [11], Pea [25], Common bean [5], and Lucerne [35].

Other reports have also shown positive results of inoculations of *Pseudomonas* spp. on nodulation, growth and productivity of legumes could be due to production of phytohormones such as auxin, gibberellins and cytokinins has been reported as a mechanism used to enhance nodule formation [12,57,58].

The increased of total chlorophyll content and nitrogen content in plant leaves as the result of bacterial isolates co-inoculation due to the increased plant nutrition and photosynthesis [10, 12,26].

## **3.3 Molecular Identification**

The bacterial strain (PS7) was identified according to previous described morphological, physiological, biochemical characters and plant test in Leonard jars as well as using analysis of 16S rRNA. According to 16S rRNA analysis, the phylogenetic tree of the isolated bacteria (PS7) and related bacterial species based on the 16S rRNA sequence is shown in Fig. 3. It can be clearly seen that the isolated bacteria was included in the genus *Pseudomonas* and closely related to the species *Pseudomonas koreensis*. It showed the highest sequence similarities with *Pseudomonas koreensis* (95%). Sequence data were submitted to GenBank and it provided a GenBank accession number MG209738.

Of these, *Pseudomonas koreensis* MG209738 was selected with *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) for studying the ability of coinoculation to improve nodulation, growth and yield of common bean plants under lyzemeter conditions.

## **3.4 Lyzemeter Experiment**

#### **3.4.1 Inoculation effects on common bean growth and symbiosis**

Four treatments  $(T_1:$  control,  $T_2:$  inoculation with *P. koreensis* MG209738, T<sub>3</sub>: inoculation with *R*. *leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) and T4: co-inoculation with *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) and *Pseudomonas koreensis* MG209738) were studied in the present investigation to evaluate growth, nodulation and yield of common bean under lyzemeter experiment conditions at 30, 60 and harvest.

As shown in Table 2, the inoculation with the varied bio-inoculants gave significant differences than un-inoculated plants. As seen at 30 days, the treatments  $T_4$ , and  $T_3$  recorded the highest plant height  $(30.33 \text{ and } 29.00 \text{ cm plan}t^1)$ , number of nodules (37.00 and 28.66 nodule plant<sup>-1</sup> ), dry weight of plant (7.54 and 7.25 g plant-1 ) and dry weight of nodules (0.313 and  $0.226$  g plant<sup>-1</sup>), respectively as compared to control  $(T_1)$ . Similarly at 60 days, co-inoculation treatments significantly enhanced growth treatments significantly enhanced growth parameters of plant. Thus, the increased in plant height, nodulation and dry biomass observed on co-inoculated in this study further supports the data demonstrating that root infection occurred earlier with co-inoculation.

The observation that were often present in pairs and appeared to have early signs of cluster-like morphology was mirrored by observations that there were often large cluster-like nodules on the co-inoculated plants. Also, co-inoculation exert beneficial effects on growth of plants by producing phytohormones (*i.e*. auxins, gibberellic acid, cytokinins and abscisic acid etc.), increasing solubility and availability of nutrients.

*El-Nahrawy and Omara; MRJI, 21(6): 1-15, 2017; Article no.MRJI.37422*



**Fig. 2. Co**-**inoculation effects of** *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* **(TAL-3612) and different isolates of** *Pseudomonas* **sp. on a) number of nodules, b) nodules dry weight (g plant-1 ), c) total chlorophyll, and d) nitrogen content (mg plant-1 ) in common bean plants grown in greenhouse conditions. Mean values are significant at P ≤ 0.05**









In a column means followed by a common letter are not significantly different at 5% level by DMRT, T<sub>1</sub>: Control; *T2: inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738; T3: inoculation with R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612); T4: Co*-*inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738 and R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612).*

These observations coupled with the data showed by [24,25,35,37,59,60,61].

#### **3.4.2 Inoculation effect on nutrient uptake of common bean plants**

The inoculation of *R. leguminosarum* and *P. koreensis* MG209738 and their mixture led to increases in macroelements content (N, P and K) and microelements content (Zn, Mn, Fe and Cu) over control (Table 3).

The best treatment gave high contents of N, P and K was  $T_4$  treatment (co-inoculation with  $P$ . *koreensis* MG209738 and *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612)) which attained 262.33, 21.69 and 285.33 (mg plant<sup>-1</sup>), while the treatment of control (chemical fertilizer) exhibited the lowest levels 194.66, 19.72 and 254.33 (mg plant-1 ), respectively, with significant differences at 30 days of sowing. Similarly trend are showed at 60 days.

On the other hand, application of dual inoculation led to further increases of microelements contents of common bean plants as compared to single inoculation and control.  $T_4$  treatment (coinoculation) gave the highest values which recorded 37.17, 27.37, 51.79 and 4.17 (ppm plant<sup>-1</sup>) at 30 days, and 51.95, 40.34, 94.68 and 7.73 (ppm plant<sup>-1</sup>) at 60 days for Zn, Mn, Fe and Cu, respectively, as compared to single inoculation treatments ( $T_2$  and  $T_3$ ) and control.

It is important to mention here that the direct mechanisms of plant growth promotion by *Rhizobium* and *Pseudomonas* can be improved nitrogen fixation and solubilization of minerals from soil. Availability of microelements in soil by PGPR could be due to enhance in nodule initiation, number and size of nodules, nodule development,  $N_2$ -fixation rate, increasing photosynthetic pigments and play an important role involved in leghaemoglobin synthesis [37,60, 61].

Several studies showed the improvement of legume symbiosis and availability of microelements in soil by PGPR, due to enhance nodulation, nitrogen fixation and plant productivity in Common bean [10]; Pea [25]; Soybean [11]; Common bean [12]; Chickpea [33]; and Lucerne [35].

#### **3.5 Enzyme Activity**

Data of Table 4 revealed an increase in dehydrogenase and phosphatase activities with the application of the different treatments in rhizosphere of common bean plants at 30, 60 and harvest. The dehydrogenase activity was noted to decline with increasing plant age. In general, the treatments  $T_4$  and  $T_3$  recorded the highest values at all growth stages, they recorded 241.00 and 225.66  $\mu$ g TPF g<sup>-1</sup> soil day at 30 days and 249.33 and 235.00 µg TPF  $g^{-1}$ soil day<sup>-1</sup> at 60 days and 203.66 and 179.66  $\mu$ gTPF g $^{-1}$  soil day $^{-1}$  at harvest.

At 30 days after sowing, phosphatase activity of soil recorded the highest values (6.50  $\mu$ g g<sup>-1</sup> soil

h-1 ) as a result of Co-inoculation with *P. koreensis* MG209738 and *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612) significantly superior over all seed inoculation treatments and control (2.93 µg g<sup>-1</sup> soil h<sup>-1</sup>). While, at 60 days, phosphatase activity of plant rhizosphere showed that  $T_4$  and  $T_3$  treatments recorded 7.73 and 6.20  $\mu$ g g<sup>-1</sup> soil h<sup>-1</sup> then decreased to 3.10 and 3.00 20  $\mu$ g g<sup>-1</sup> soil h<sup>-1</sup> at harvest. Phosphatase activity in soil generally reduced with the aging of the plant.

In the entire crop period, the enzyme activity increased initially at 30 and 60 days and then declined with the age of the crop. These observations are in accordance with the findings of the present investigation.

Several studies showed that increases in enzyme activity has mainly due to the higher microbial population and the potential capacity of soil to perform biological transformations of importance to soil fertility [12,25,37].





In a column means followed by a common letter are not significantly different at 5% level by DMRT, T<sub>1</sub>: Control; *T2: inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738; T3: inoculation with R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612); T4: Co*-*inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738 and R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612)*





In a column means followed by a common letter are not significantly different at 5% level by DMRT, T<sub>1</sub>: Control; *T2: inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738; T3: inoculation with R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612); T4: Co*-*inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738 and R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612).*

**Table 5. Single and co**-**inoculation effect with** *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli*  **(TAL-3612) and** *Pseudomonas koreensis* **MG209738 on number of pods, pod yield (g plant-1 ), seed yield (ton ha-1 ), total carbohydrate (%) and protein (%) of common bean plants**

<b>Treatment</b>	Number of pods	Pod yield (g plant <sup>"</sup> )	Seed yield $($ ton ha $^{-1}$ )	<b>Total carbohydrate</b> (%)	Protein (%)
$T_{4}$	15.00 <sup>c</sup>	224.66 <sup>d</sup>	3.68 <sup>d</sup>	48.33 <sup>c</sup>	18.00 $^{\circ}$
T <sub>2</sub>	17.66 <sup>b</sup>	247.00 °	4.90 $c$	51.66 <sup>b</sup>	20.66 <sup>b</sup>
$T_3$	20.66 <sup>a</sup>	268.66 <sup>b</sup>	5.33 $b$	53.00 <sup>b</sup>	22.66 <sup>a</sup>
T <sub>4</sub>	22.00 <sup>a</sup>	298.66 <sup>a</sup>	5.53 <sup>a</sup>	55.33 <sup>a</sup>	23.66 <sup>a</sup>
LSD (0.05)	1.53	6.58	0.133	2.10	1.88

*In a column means followed by a common letter are not significantly different at 5% level by DMRT, T<sub>1</sub>: Control; T2: inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738; T3: inoculation with R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612); T4: Co*-*inoculation with P. koreensis MG209738 and R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli (TAL-3612).*

#### **3.6 Seed Yield and Quality Assessment**

Data presented in Table 5 (above) indicated that co-inoculation with the different bio-inoculants variably increases number of pods, pod yield (g plant<sup>-1</sup>), seed yield (ton ha<sup>-1</sup>), total carbohydrate (%) and protein (%) of common bean plants.

Number of pods  $plant<sup>-1</sup>$  was significantly increased due to combined inoculation with *P. koreensis* MG209738 and *R. leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612). Statistically, significant results were recorded in  $T<sub>4</sub>$  treatment which showing number of pods  $(22.00 \text{ plant}^{-1})$ which was significantly superior over control  $(15.00 \text{ plant}^{-1})$ . On the other hand, the maximum values of pod yield (g plant<sup>-1</sup>) was observed in T<sub>4</sub> followed by  $T_3$  and  $T_2$  (298.66, 268.66 and 247.00 g  $\text{plant}^{-1}$ ), respectively compared to chemical fertilizer (control). For seed yield (ton ha<sup>-1</sup>), the treatments  $T_4$  and  $T_3$  attained the highest seed yield  $(5.530$  and  $5.330$  ton ha<sup>-1</sup>) compared to T1 (control),  $3.680$  ton ha<sup>-1</sup> , respectively. The results of total carbohydrate and protein (%) in seeds of common bean showed significant variations under coinoculation, which recorded the higher values in  $T_4$  treatment 55.33 and 23.66% compared to 48.33 and 18.00% for  $T_1$  (control), respectively.

In general, the maximum increase in yield parameters due to combined inoculation of PGPR was documented and it is important to estimate carbohydrate and protein contents in the yielded seeds of common bean plant for seed quality assessment.

These results was confirmed with those of other researchers who reported that increasing number of pods, pod yield (g plant<sup>-1</sup>), seed yield (ton ha<sup>-</sup>

 $<sup>1</sup>$ ), total carbohydrates and protein in the yielded</sup> seeds with using different PGPR [37,62,63,64].

## **4. CONCLUSION**

This study confirms that the selected *Pseudomonas* can improve the growth, nodulation, nitrogen fixation and increase yield parameters of common bean plants inoculated with *Rhizobium leguminosarium sembiovar phaseoli* (TAL-3612).

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

Thanks to all staff members and colleagues in The Bacteriology Research Laboratory, Sakha Agricultural Research Station, Kafr El-Sheikh, Egypt for their valuable cooperation which made completion of this work possible.

#### **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

#### **REFERENCES**

1. Hibbing M, Fuqua C, Parsek M, Peterson S. Bacterial competition: Surviving and thriving in the microbial jungle. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 2009;8:15–25.

DOI: 10.1038/nrmicro2259

2. Hartmann A, Schmid M, Tuinen D, Berg G. Plant-driven selection of microbes. Plant Soil. 2008;321:235–257.

DOI: 10.1007/ s11104-008-9814-y

3. Ayala S, Rao EVSP. Perspective of soil fertility management with a focus on

fertilizer use for crop productivity. Curr. Sci. 2002;82:797–807.

- 4. McConnell M, Mamidi S, Lee R, Chikara S, Rossi M, Papa R, McClean P. Syntenic relationships among legumes revealed using a gene-based genetic linkage map of common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.), TAG. Theoretical and applied genetics, Theor. Angew. Genet. 2010;121:1103- 1116.
- 5. Talaat NB, Ghoniem AE, Abdelhamid MT, Shawky BT. Effective microorganisms<br>improve growth performance, alter improve growth performance, alter nutrients acquisition and induce compatible solutes accumulation in common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) plants subjected to salinity stress. Plant Growth Regul. 2015;75:281–295.

DOI: 10.1007/s10725-014-9952-6

- 6. Asadi RH, Afshari M, Khavazi K, Nourgholipour F, Otadi A. Effects of common bean nodulating rhizobia native to Iranian soils on the yield and quality of bean. Iranian. J. Soil Water Sci. 2005;19: 215-225.
- 7. Mnasri B, Tajini F, Trablesi M, Aouani ME, Mhamdi R. *Rhizobium gallicum* as an efficient symbiont for bean cultivation. Agron. Sustain. Dev. 2007;27:331-336.
- 8. Estévez J, Dardanelli MS, Megías M, Rodríguez-Navarro DN. Symbiotic performance of common bean and soybean co-inoculated with rhizobia and *Chryseobacterium balustinum* Aur9 under moderate saline conditions. Symbiosis. 2009;49:29–36.

DOI: 10.1007/s13199-009-0008-z

- 9. Yadegari M, Rahmani HA. Evaluation of bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris*) seeds' inoculation with *Rhizobium phaseoli* and plant growth promoting Rhizobacteria (PGPR) on yield and yield components. Afri. J. Agric. Res. 2010;5(9):792-799.
- 10. Samavat S, Samavat S, Mafakheri1 S, Javad Shakouri M. Promoting Common Bean Growth and Nitrogen Fixation by the Co-Inoculation of *Rhizobium* and *Pseudomonas fluorescens* Isolates. Bulga. J. Agric. Sci. 2012;18:387-395.
- 11. Soe KM, Yamakawa T. Evaluation of effective Myanmar *Bradyrhizobium* strains isolated from Myanmar soybean and effects of coinoculation with *Streptomyces griseoflavus* P4 for nitrogen fixation. Soil Sci. Plant Nutri. 2013;59:361–370.
- 12. Sánchez AC, Roldán TG, René CS, Alianny RU, Maarten F, Jan M, Jos V. Effects of co-inoculation of native *Rhizobium* and *Pseudomonas* strains on growth parameters and yield of two<br>contrasting Phaseolus vulgaris L. contrasting *Phaseolus vulgaris* L. genotypes under Cuban soil conditions. Euro. J. Soil Biol. 2014;62:105-112.
- 13. Brockwell J, Bottomley PJ, Thies JE. Manipulation of rhizobia microflora for improving legume productivity and soil fertility: A critical assessment. Plant Soil. 1995;174:143–180.
- 14. Vance CP. Legume symbiotic nitrogen fixation: Argonomic aspects. In The Rhizobiace: Molecular Biology of Model Plant-Associated Bacteria. Spaink HP, Kondorosi A, HooykasJJ. eds, Kluvier Academic Publishers. 1998;509–30.
- 15. Catroux G, Hartmann A, Revellin C. Trends in rhizobial inoculant production and use. Plant and Soil. 2001;230:21–30.
- 16. Deaker R, Roughley RJ, Kennedy IR. Legume seed inoculation technology - a review. Soil Biol. Biochem. 2004;36:1275– 1288.
- 17. Wardle DA, Bardgett RD, Klironomos JN, Setälä H, Van der Putten WH, Wall D H. Ecological linkages between aboveground and belowground biota. Science. 2004; 304:1629–1633.
- 18. Van der Heijden MGA, Bardgett RD, Van Straalen NM. The unseen majority: Soil microbes as drivers of plant diversity and productivity in terrestrial ecosystems. Ecology Letters. 2008;11:296–310.
- 19. Marek-Kozaczuk M, Skorupska A. Production of B group vitamins by plant<br>growth-promoting Pseudomonas growth-promoting *Pseudomonas fluorescens* strain 267 and the importance of vitamins in the colonization and nodulation of red clover. Biol. Fert. Soils. 2001;33:146–151.
- 20. Khan MS, Zaidi A, Wani PA, Ahemad M, Oves M. Functional diversity among plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria: Current status. In: Khan MS et al. (eds) Microbial strategies for crop improvement. Springer, Berlin. 2009;105–132.
- 21. Hol WHG, Bezemer TM, Biere A. Getting the ecology into interactions between plants and the plant growth-promoting bacterium *Pseudomonas fluorescens*. Front. Plant Sci; 2013. DOI: org/10.3389/fpls.2013.00081
- 22. Cook RJ, Thomashow LS, Weller DM, Fujimoto D, Mazzola M, Bangera G, Kim DS. Molecular mechanism of defense by rhizobacteria against root disease. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA. 1995;92:4179– 4201
- 23. Weger LA, Arjan J, Van DB, Linda C, Dekkers MS, Care1 AW, Ben JJL. Colonization of the rhizosphere of crop plants by plant-beneficial *Pseudomonads*. FEMS Microbio. Eco. 1995;17:221-228.
- 24. Fox SL, Graham WO, Lambert B. Enhanced nodulation and symbiotic effectiveness of *Medicago truncatula* when co-inoculated with *Pseudomonas fluorescens* WSM3457 and *Ensifer (Sinorhizobium) medicae* WSM419. Plant Soil. 2011;348:245–254.

DOI: 10.1007/s11104-011-0959-8

- 25. Ahmad E, Khan MS, Zaidi A. ACC deaminase producing *Pseudomonas putida* strain PSE3 and *Rhizobium leguminosarum* strain RP2 in synergism improves growth, nodulation and yield of pea grown in alluvial soils. Symbiosis. 2013;61:93–104.
- 26. Soussou S, Brigitte B, Marjorie P, Diederik VT, Jean CCM, Ezékiel B. Rhizobacterial *Pseudomonas* spp. Strains harbouring acds gene could enhance metallicolous legume nodulation in Zn/Pb/Cd mine tailings. Water Air Soil Pollut. 2017;228: 142.

DOI: 10.1007/s11270-017-3309-5

- 27. Morel MA, Bran˜a V, Castro-Sowinski S. Legume crops, importance and use of bacterial inoculation to increase production. In: Goyal S (ed) Crop plant. INTECH, Croatia. 2012;217–240.
- 28. Mehboob I, Naveed M, Zahir ZA, Sessitsch A. Potential of rhizosphere bacteria for improving *Rhizobium*legume symbiosis. In: Arora NK (ed) Plan microbe symbiosis: Fundamentals and advances. Springer, New Delhi. 2013;305– 1349.
- 29. Ma W, Guinel FC, Glick BR. *Rhizobium leguminosarum* biovar *viciae* 1 aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylate deaminase promotes nodulation of pea plants. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 2003; 69:4396–4402.
- 30. Ma W, Charles TC, Glick BR. Expression of an exogenous 1 aminocyclopropane-1 carboxylate deaminase gene in

*Sinorhizobium meliloti* increases its ability to nodulate alfalfa. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 2004;70:5891–5897.

- 31. Noreen S, Ali B, Hasnain S. Growth promotion of *Vigna mungo* (L.) by *Pseudomonas* spp. exhibiting auxin production and ACCdeaminase activity. Ann. Microbiol. 2012;62:411–417.
- 32. Nascimento F, Brı´gido C, Alho L, Glick BR, Oliveira S. Enhanced chickpea growth promotion ability of a mesorhizobia expressing an exogenous ACC deaminase gene. Plant Soil. 2012; 353:221–230.
- 33. Gopalakrishnan S, Srinivas V, Alekhya G, Prakash B, Kudapa H, Rathore A, Varshney RK. The extent of grain yield and plant growth enhancement by plant<br>growth-promoting broad-spectrum growth-promoting *Streptomyces* sp. in chickpea. Springer Plus. 2015;4:1–10.
- 34. Younesi O, Abolfazl B, Amin N. The effects of *Pseudomonas fluorescence* and *Rhizobium meliloti* co-inoculation on nodulation and mineral nutrient contents in alfalfa (*Medicago sativa*) under salinity stress. Int. J. Agri. Crop Sci. 2013;5(14): 1500-1507.
- 35. Le XH, Ross AB, Christopher MMF. Effects of endophytic streptomyces and mineral nitrogen on lucerne (*Medicago sativa* L.) growth and its symbiosis with rhizobia. Plant Soil. 2016;405:25–34. DOI: 10.1007/s11104-015-2704-1
- 36. Soe KM, Bhromsiri A, Karladee D, Yamakawa T. Effects of endophytic actinomycetes and *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* strains on growth, nodulation, nitrogen fixation and seed weight of different soybean varieties. Soil Sci. Plant Nutr. 2012;58:319–325.
- 37. Omara A, Hauka F, Aida A, Nour El-Din M, Kassem M. The role of some PGPR strains to biocontrol *Rhizoctonia solani* in soybean and enhancement the growth dynamics and seed yield. Environ., Biodiv. Soil Security. 2017;1:47–59.
- 38. King E, Ward W, Ramy D. Two simple media for the demonstration of pyocyanin and fluorescence. J Lab Clin Med. 1954; 44:301–307.
- 39. Holt JG, Krieg NR, Sneath PHA, Staley JT, Willams ST. Bergeys manual of determinative bacteriology. Williams and Wilkins, Baltimore; 1994.
- 40. Vincent JM. A manual for the practical study of root- nodule bacteria. Blackwell, Oxford; 1970.
- 41. Somasegaran P, Hoben MJ. Methods in legume rhizobium technology. prepared under USA agency for international Development; 1985.
- 42. Allen ON. Experiments in soil Bacteriology. University of Wiscosin second printing. 1959;202.
- 43. Black AC, Evans DD, White JL, Ensminyer EL, Clark EF. Methods of soil analysis. Amer. Soc. Agro. Inc. Mad. Wise U. S. A.; 1965.
- 44. Jackson ML. Soil chemical analysis. Prentice-Hall of India, New Delhi; 1967.
- 45. Cottenie A, Verloo M, Kiekens L, Velghe G, Camerlynck R. Chemical analysis of plants and soils. Laboratory of Analytical and Agrochemistry. State University, Ghent. 1982;14–24.
- 46. Herbert D, Phipps P, Strange R. Determination of total carbohydrate. Methods Microbiol. 1971;5B:209–344.
- 47. Montogomery R. Further studies of the phenol-sulphuric acid reagent for carbohydrate. Biochim. Biophys. Acta. 1961;48:591–593.
- 48. Allen MB. Exp. In Soil Bacteriology.  $1<sup>st</sup>$  Ed. Burgess Puble Co.; 1953.
- 49. Casida LE, Klein DA and Snatoro T. Soil dehydrogenase activity. Soil Sci. 1964;98: 371-376.
- 50. Tabatabai MA. Soil enzymes. In: Page AL, Miller RH, Keeney DR (Eds.). Methods Of Soil Analysis, Part 2. Chemical and Microbiological Properties. Ameri. Soci. Agron. Madison. 1982;903-948.
- 51. Steel D, Torrie JH. Principles and procedures of statistics. Ambiometrical approach. 2<sup>nd</sup> Ed. McGraw Hill, New York, USA.; 1980.
- 52. Zahir ZA, Zafar-ul-Hye M, Sajjad S, Naveed M. Comparative effectiveness of *Pseudomonas* and *Serratia* sp. containing ACC-deaminase for coinoculation with *Rhizobium leguminosarum* to improve growth, nodulation, and yield of lentil. Biolo. Ferti. Soils. 2011;47:457–465.
- 53. Stearns JC, Woody OZ, McConkey BJ, Glick BR. Effects of bacterial ACC deaminase on *Brassica napus* gene expression. MPMI. 2012;25:668– 676.
- 54. Shahzad SM, Khalid A, Arshad M, Tahir J, Mahmood T. Improving nodulation, growth and yield of *Cicer arietinum* L. through bacterial ACC-deaminase induced changes in root architecture. Euro. J. Soil Biolo. 2010;46:342–347.
- 55. Murset V, Hennecke H, Pessi G. Disparate role of rhizobial ACC deaminase in rootnodule symbioses. Symbiosis. 2012; 57:43–50.
- 56. Arshad M, Frakenberger WTJ. Ethylene: Agricultural sources and applications. Kluwer/Academic Publishers, New York; 2002.
- 57. Valverde A, Burgos A, Fiscella T, Rivas R, Velazquez E, Rodriguez- Barrueco C, Cervantes E, Chamber M, Igual JM. Differential effects of coinoculations with<br>Pseudomonas iessenii PS06 (a *Pseudomonas jessenii* PS06 (a phosphate-solubilizing bacterium) and *Mesorhizobium ciceri* C-2/2 strains on the growth and seed yield of chickpea under greenhouse and field conditions. Plant Soil. 2006;287:43-50.
- 58. Remans R, Beebe S, Blair M, Manrique G, Tovar E, Rao I, Croonenborghs A, Torres-Gutiérrez R, El-Howeity M, Michiels J, Vanderleyden J. Physiological and genetic analysis of root responsiveness to auxinproducing plant growth-promoting bacteria in common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.). Plant and Soil. 2008;302:149–161.
- 59. Kasotia A, Ajit V, Devendra KC. *Pseudomonas*-mediated mitigation of salt stress and growth promotion in *Glycine max*. Agric. Res. 2015;4(1):31–41. DOI: 10.1007/s40003-014-0139-1
- 60. Solanki MK, Mukesh KM, Zheng W. Actinomycetes bio-inoculants: A modern prospectus for plant disease management. Springer Science+Business Media Singapore, G. Subramaniam et al. (eds.), Plant Growth Promoting Actinobacteria; 2016.

DOI: 10.1007/978-981-10-0707-1\_5

61. Sathya A, Rajendran V, Subramaniam growth-promoting actinobacteria: A new strategy for enhancing sustainable production and protection of grain legumes. 3 Biotech. 2017;7:102.

DOI: 10.1007/s13205-017-0736-3

62. Elkhatib HA. Growth and Yield of Common Bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) in Response

to *Rhizobium* Inoculation, Nitrogen and Molybdenum Fertilization. Alex. Sci. Excha. J. 2009;30(2).

63. El-Rokiek KG, Saad EL-Din S, Faida S. Allelopathic behaviour of *Cyperus rotundus* L. on both *Chorchorus Olitorius* (broad leaved weed) and Echinochloa Crus-Galli ( grassy weed) associsted with soybean. J. Plant Prot. Res. 2010; 50(3):274-279.

64. Sarma I, Phukon M, Borgohain R, Goswami J, Neog M. Response of french bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) to organic manure, vermicompost and biofertilizers on growth parameters and yield. Asian J. Hort. 2014;9(2):386-389.

 $\_$  , and the set of th *© 2017 El-Nahrawy and Omara; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.*

> *Peer-review history: The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here: http://sciencedomain.org/review-history/21781*